

5i 3/12/1323/FP – Single and two storey front, side and rear extensions, raising of roof and construction of detached garage and carport following demolition of existing garage at The Slough, Slough Road, Allens Green, CM21 0LR for Mr and Mrs Holbrook

Date of Receipt: 02.08.2012

Type: Full - Other

Parish: HIGH WYCH

Ward: MUCH HADHAM

RECOMMENDATION:

That planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

1. Three Year Time Limit (1T121)
2. Approved plans (2E103) (insert:- 1117/PL2/100, 1117/PL2/150, 1117/PL2/200, 1117/PL2/300, 1117/PL2/400, 1117/PL2/SE/800 A 1117/PL2/801 and 1117/PL2/CP/500)
3. Materials of Construction (2E11)
4. Prior to the commencement of development, drawings detailing the extent of the structure of the existing dwelling to be retained, shall be submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the development shall thereafter be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the development is not tantamount to a replacement dwelling, in accordance with policy GBC3 of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007.

Directive:

1. Other legislation (01OL1)

Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan, May 2008, Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and the saved policies of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007, and in particular policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5 and ENV6) and the National Planning Policy Framework. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies and the limited harm to the character and appearance or openness of the Rural Area is that permission should be granted.

1.0 Background:

- 1.1 The application site is shown on the attached OS extract. The Slough lies within the Rural Area beyond the Metropolitan Green Belt. The property is a chalet bungalow, constructed in the 1950's, with dormer windows and a single garage sited to the west of the main dwelling. The dwelling has been constructed in render and has a tile roof and is sited some 12 metres back from the highway. The existing dwelling is encompassed by a large garden, beyond the rear of which are open fields
- 1.2 The proposal seeks permission for the provision of extensions to the existing property following the demolition of the existing garage. Two storey extensions would extend from the west, front and rear elevations of the existing dwelling and a single storey element would adjoin the east flank elevation. It is also proposed to raise the roof of the existing dwelling and construct a detached garage with double carport, sited to the west of the property.

2.0 Site History:

- 2.1 Planning permission was granted within LPA reference 3/54/0665/FP for the construction of The Slough with detached garage.

3.0 Consultation Responses:

- 3.1 County Highways comment that this application will not impact upon highway safety or capacity and would not affect parking within the site, or the existing vehicle access arrangements.

4.0 Parish Council Representations:

- 4.1 High Wych Parish Council object to the proposal and comment that the development represents a scale that exceeds what is appropriate.

5.0 Other Representations:

- 5.1 The application has been advertised by way of site notice and neighbour notification.
- 5.2 No letters of representation have been received.

6.0 Policy:

6.1 The relevant 'saved' Local Plan policies in this application include the following:

GBC3	Appropriate Development in the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt
ENV1	Design and Environmental Quality
ENV5	Extensions to Dwellings
ENV6	Extensions to Dwellings – Criteria

6.2 In addition, the National Planning Policy Framework is relevant.

7.0 Considerations:

7.1 The main planning considerations relate to the principle of development and its impact on the character and appearance of the dwelling, its rural surroundings and on neighbour amenity.

Principle of development

7.2 The application site is located within the Rural Area beyond the Green Belt, wherein limited extensions and alterations to dwellings will be permitted in accordance with policies GBC3 and ENV5 of the Local Plan. Policy ENV5 states that an extension to a dwelling will be expected to be of a scale and size that, either by itself or cumulatively with other extensions, would not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling nor intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area. Within the Rural Area, the Council is concerned about the effect an extension may have on the character and appearance of an existing dwelling, both in itself and in relation to any adjoining dwelling and on the appearance of the locality. The Council is also concerned with the effect of extensions on the general maintenance of a supply of smaller dwellings outside of the main towns and settlements, and also with the cumulative impact of development in the countryside.

7.3 The proposed extensions would increase the size of the original dwelling by 139%. When including the proposed detached garage/carport, the original dwelling would be increased by some 177%. The proposed extensions and garage do not therefore represent limited extensions within the Rural Area. In this respect the proposed development does not accord with policy GBC3(c), and it is therefore necessary to consider whether material considerations exist in this case to warrant a departure from policy.

- 7.4 The existing property is a modest 1½ storeys in height, with one dormer window sited in the front roof slope and one sited in the rear. Attached to the west flank elevation of the existing dwellinghouse (via a 2.5 metre long wall) is a single storey garage/store. It is acknowledged that the proposed development would increase the height of the existing dwelling and would include extensions extending from the rear elevation of the existing property by between 2 and 6 metres and a side extension measuring 6 metres in width. The resultant extensions would therefore increase the existing ground floor and first floor areas of the dwelling quite significantly, as well as the overall volume of the existing dwelling.
- 7.5 Officers however have taken into consideration that the proposed development would only increase the footprint of the existing dwelling by approximately 94m² and that the roof ridge of the existing dwelling would be raised by a modest 0.9 metres in height. Regard has also been given to the siting of the larger extensions - to the rear of the dwelling. To the front elevation, the proposed extensions have been limited to project 1.4 metres from the existing front building line and, although the proposed side extension would have a width of 6 metres, the reduced eaves and ridge height, together with its half-hipped design result in an extension that is subservient in relation to the extended dwelling. Taking this into account and that the dwelling would still be set at least 10 metres back from the highway, it is considered that the proposed development would not result in harm to the character or appearance of the existing dwelling and would not be to the detriment of the character and appearance of the immediate surroundings, or openness of the rural area.
- 7.6 In this instance, it is also important for members to have regard to a planning permission for extensive alterations and extensions to a nearby property under ref. 3/09/0994/FP. This application for the *'raising of roof with front and rear dormer windows to create first floor accommodation; two storey side and rear extensions and new front porch; block paving in front of dwelling to create vehicle parking and new chimney stacks'* was allowed on appeal at a property known as Lorraine in October 2009 which is to the north-west of the application site. Lorraine was also a modest single storey bungalow but the appeal decision allowed the above-mentioned substantial extensions. This appeal decision is relevant to this application and forms a material planning consideration.
- 7.7 In terms of design, the proposed extensions would appear modern in their form and design. Several larger, glazed openings are proposed to

be sited in the front and rear elevations of the proposed extensions and existing dwelling. The introduction of several gable elements and dormer windows with pitched roofs is also proposed. Whilst such design elements and fenestration would alter the character and appearance of the existing 1950's chalet bungalow, Officers have had regard to the design of several of the neighbouring properties, which have dormer windows sited within their front and rear roof slopes and contemporary designs; and also the modest size of the proposed dormer windows, fenestration and gable elements which, together with their balanced and appropriate siting, would not be visually dominant or stand out in this row of properties or detract from the open, rural qualities of the immediate or wider locality.

7.8 The proposal also involves the construction of a detached garage with double carport. The proposed building would have a footprint of almost 60m² and would reach a height of 5.6 metres. The proposed garage/carport would be sited at least 10 metres back from the highway and would have its smaller, side elevation facing towards the street scene. Taking this into account and that it has been designed with a low eaves height and to reflect an outbuilding that would be typically located in the rural area, it is considered that the proposed garage/carport would not have a harmful impact upon the open character and appearance of the rural area.

7.9 Having regard to the above considerations, Officers are of the opinion that the proposed extensions and outbuilding are of an appropriate size, scale, form and design such that they would not result in significant harm to the character, appearance or openness of the rural site. Taking this into account and the application allowed at appeal for considerable extensions to the neighbouring property known as Lorraine, it is considered that, as outlined above, there are reasons in this case to allow a departure from policy.

Highways

7.10 The proposed extensions would increase the number of bedrooms the existing property has from two to five. Having regard to the spacious driveway area to the front of the site that is to be retained and the double carport and garage that is to be constructed, together with the comments from the Highways Authority who do not object to the proposal, the development would not result in on-street parking or be detrimental to highway safety.

Neighbour amenity considerations

3/12/1323/FP

7.11 Having regard to the relationship of the dwelling to neighbours and the isolated nature of the site, Officers consider that there will be no impact on neighbour amenity.

8.0 Conclusion:

8.1 Officers consider that the amount of development proposed cannot be considered as 'limited', and is therefore contrary to policies GBC3 and ENV5 of the Local Plan. However, the proposed extensions and garage building are considered to be appropriately designed, and will not result in significant harm to the character and appearance of the dwelling or its rural setting.

8.2 It is therefore considered that, whilst the proposal does not accord with policies GBC3 or ENV5 of the Local Plan, there are reasons in this case to allow a departure from policy. In all other respects the proposal is considered to accord with the relevant policies of the Local Plan. It is therefore recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions set out above.